

██████—

I think that you have done a good job of reading your own paper. I locate revision work in two places. First, I'd like to know more about the texts that are important to you. I think you *say* they are important, but I don't know that I have reason to believe you. I think that I'd very much like to know more about your graphic novel material. And, perhaps more importantly, you don't really make me see why *Gatsby* did it for you. You might quote. You might recall a particular scene. You do use passionately quite a lot. Most of all, there is something going on in the paper about how you wanted to write that paper and do a good job on it. That is the missing connection between what you say about your reading experiences and what you want to say about how this will matter to your teaching. This is the place to develop. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

██████—

I locate revision work in two places. First, I think that you need to convince me more that this text mattered to you. You tell me that it was important, but you don't spend anytime showing me. You need to bring the text into the essay more. What about Harry Potter was so thrilling. You are right that some of your sentences seem to not be in the place where they belong. You should consider what you want to say in each paragraph and consider if all the sentences you've got written there work there. But the biggest issue, is that I'm not sure that I see the connection between what you are telling me about the book and what you have to say at the very end about your mom working hard to help you to read. This is not what the entire essay is about. I think that this is, however, what your essay is about. So I think that you need to connect the Harry Potter and the part about your mother's work in helping you to read. That connection has to do with a thesis and it also connects to what you will want to say about teaching. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

██████—

I locate a few places for revision. First, I don't know that you need that opening paragraph. It is sort of a "since the dawn of man" paragraph—vaguely but not really connected to what you really want to say. You start to really get in to what reading meant to you in the second paragraph. I think you've done a good job of reading your own paper. First, I'd like to know more about the texts that are important to you. I think you *say* they are important, but I don't know that I have reason to believe you. You might quote. You might recall a particular scene. You notice this yourself. The other thing that I would draw your attention to is that you bring up some points that could contribute to teaching, but you don't much talk about this. I've tried to draw your attention to this in the text. This should be where you bring your paper at the end—to turn your own experiences into teaching. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

■—

I think this is pretty successful draft. I locate places for revision in a few places. First, you don't have a title and that makes me nuts. Also, don't have a bad title like "My Mentor Text Memoir." Secondly, you identify rather figuring out a way to scam the reading rather than actually doing the reading. This is important since many people do this—your own story shows it. So really digging in to why students don't want to read, what they fear, why they rather do all the work to scam it (which is more work than reading) than actually read. That will bring a lot of depth to the opening of the paper. The other location of revision is the end where you talk about the teacher's enthusiasm as a way to teach reading. So, OK, she's enthusiastic, but how is that a pedagogy? What really changed in your reading habits for all books because that teacher was excited about this one book? That needs some interrogation and will give a stronger conclusion to your paper. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

■—

I don't really know what to make of this paper. It's like you cut and pasted material from three different book reports in to this paper. The opening line is a good one, but the rest of the first paragraph is a series of sentences that seem not to be connected. I just have no idea what to make of this and it makes it difficult for me to comment on your paper. I feel like you need to write this paper for the assignment that I gave you. That's the most useful thing I can write at this moment.

I want to take this opportunity to say that I have some concern about your student behavior. You come to class with ear buds in and your computer on. You are not taking notes on class. You are often doing something with music. Your last reading journal was competent, but I have to say that prior to that, when you did turn them in, they did not meet the minimum requirements of the assignment. I don't understand your behavior in the class. It is not the behavior of someone who wants to do well and it concerns me that someone who wants to be a teacher would turn in this performance.





Meghan—

I locate revision work in two places. First, I think that you need to convince me more that this text mattered to you. You tell me that it was important, but you don't spend anytime showing me. You need to bring the text into the essay more. What about Harry Potter was so thrilling. You are right that some of your sentences seem to not be in the place where they belong. You should consider what you want to say in each paragraph and consider if all the sentences you've got written there work there. But the biggest issue, is that I'm not sure that I see the connection between what you are telling me about the book and what you have to say at the very end about your mom working hard to help you to read. This is not what the entire essay is about. I think that this is, however, what your essay is about. So I think that you need to connect the Harry Potter and the part about your mother's work in helping you to read. That connection has to do with a thesis and it also connects to what you will want to say about teaching. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Heather—

I locate a few places for revision. First, I don't know that you need that opening paragraph. It is sort of a "since the dawn of man" paragraph—vaguely but not really connected to what you really want to say. You start to really get in to what reading meant to you in the second paragraph. The next area is that you have a tendency to write around what you want to say about reading. I have noted those places in the text. I think that in a revision you need to hit those points harder. The other thing is that you've got a lot of these points, but I'm not clear what you want to say cumulatively. You introduce another whole idea in that last paragraph. So while I think that you talk about what you will do in your classroom, but the why of it is hazy and scattered. If you could bring those moments of the paper together, I think you would have a stronger crescendo at the end. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Connor—

You actually did a good job of reading your own text. I locate your need for revisions in a two places. You talk about reading out loud and making your father proud, but that is not really about liking a book or a story or feeling like you've learning something from the experience of the book. I don't think that's bad, but I think you need to focus on what really happened there—there is something here about somebody expecting something of you, wanting to meet that expectation, about achievement. So I would spend the time to talk more about this. Also, the whole process of how you managed to become a good reader is not a part of the paper at all. That should be developed. The *Miracle Worker* piece, is, as you say, doesn't really help you make your point. I think that you develop an idea about reading taking your places late in the essay. I think that this could work to help you bring the essay all together. And that might help you with your ending. It would help you think about a turn toward being someone who will be teaching reading instead of just being a reader. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Hannah—

I locate a few places for revision. First, I don't know that you need that opening paragraph. It is sort of a "since the dawn of man" paragraph—vaguely but not really connected to what you really want to say. You start to really get in to what reading meant to you in the second paragraph. I think you've done a good job of reading your own paper. First, I'd like to know more about the texts that are important to you. I think you *say* they are important, but I don't know that I have reason to believe you. You might quote. You might recall a particular scene. You notice this yourself. The other thing that I would draw your attention to is that you bring up some points that could contribute to teaching, but you don't much talk about this. I've tried to draw your attention to this in the text. This should be where you bring your paper at the end—to turn your own experiences into teaching. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.



Matthew—

I loved your title. You had the best title in the class. And, yes, you had a title. I like your opening as well, which is not your generic run of the mill opening. You know as I said in class that a lot of people had a “since the dawn of man” feel. So all that is good. I locate your need for revision in two places. First, I think that you need to make some decisions about what this story means about reading. I get what the book means to you. That’s good, but you need to move out from that. I need to understand what you understand about what is important about reading and then, of course, what you understand about what is important about teaching reading. That is underdeveloped in the paper. You’ve got some stuff late in the paper that I’ve tried to call your attention to. If you look to those comments, I think that you’ll see what I’m talking about. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Kevin—

I don’t really know what to make of this paper. It’s like you cut and pasted material from three different book reports in to this paper. The opening line is a good one, but the rest of the first paragraph is a series of sentences that seem not to be connected. I just have no idea what to make of this and it makes it difficult for me to comment on your paper. I feel like you need to write this paper for the assignment that I gave you. That’s the most useful thing I can write at this moment.

I want to take this opportunity to say that I have some concern about your student behavior. You come to class with ear buds in and your computer on. You are not taking notes on class. You are often doing something with music. Your last reading journal was competent, but I have to say that prior to that, when you did turn them in, they did not meet the minimum requirements of the assignment. I don’t understand your behavior in the class. It is not the behavior of someone who wants to do well and it concerns me that someone who wants to be a teacher would turn in this performance.

Matthew—

I loved your title. You had the best title in the class. And, yes, you had a title. I like your opening as well, which is not your generic run of the mill opening. You know as I said in class that a lot of people had a “since the dawn of man” feel. So all that is good. I locate your need for revision in two places. First, I think that you need to make some decisions about what this story means about reading. I get what the book means to you. That’s good, but you need to move out from that. I need to understand what you understand about what is important about reading and then, of course, what you understand about what is important about teaching reading. That is underdeveloped in the paper. You’ve got some stuff late in the paper that I’ve tried to call your attention to. If you look to those comments, I think that you’ll see what I’m talking about. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Elizabeth—

This is an accomplished draft. Perhaps the most accomplished I read. It includes all the things that I find so strong in your reading journals—your care and close attention to the text. I appreciate your tight focus on *Beloved*. A few places you can focus your revision. You might include some discussion of the theorists on page two. Not everyone can, but you could. You are at this place. I do think you need to give a short summary of *Beloved*. This isn't a movie review. I do think that your sense of what the last paragraph should be is right. The reason I think the discussion of the difficulty could use the theorists is because it will help you to pinpoint the real contribution difficulty makes to helping students be great readers. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Kevin J.

---

I think you've done a good job of reading your own paper. While there is a bit of redundancy (and you'll see where from my comments) when you talk about your passion for *The Tempest*, it does, for the most part, accomplish what you need to do. I wouldn't mind some actual scenes from the play and language to show specifics of your struggle and of your discovery. I think those concrete examples would prove more compelling than simply overview. The other place I would direct you to is making a decision about what this is about—what it tells us about teaching reading. It is about difficulty and conquering a text and about assistance. I don't see the part about assistance coming when it shows up in the paper. Up until then it felt like the text was just about conquer. So you want to think about how to make the assistance part more of the text. You might include some discussion of our theorists if you like. You don't have to, but you are ready to do it—it helps you with both assistance and with conquering a text. Comments in the margin should direct you to where you need to be. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Julie—

I think this is pretty successful draft. I locate places for revision in a few places. First, you don't have a title and that makes me nuts. Also, don't have a bad title like "My Mentor Text Memoir." Secondly, you identify rather figuring out a way to scam the reading rather than actually doing the reading. This is important since many people do this—your own story shows it. So really digging in to why students don't want to read, what they fear, why they rather do all the work to scam it (which is more work than reading) than actually read. That will bring a lot of depth to the opening of the paper. The other location of revision is the end where you talk about the teacher's enthusiasm as a way to teach reading. So, OK, she's enthusiastic, but how is that a pedagogy? What really changed in your reading habits for all books because that teacher was excited about this one book? That needs some interrogation and will give a stronger conclusion to your paper. This is the work that will move this piece of writing to the next level. I look forward to the revision.

Cody—

I think that you've got a nice way in your writing. It's got a nice voice to it. A lot of folks don't write with much style and personality. So that's a pleasure to read. I locate three places for attention as you revise. First, I think I'd like to know more about patience and not wanting to read. I'm not arguing with you, I think it is true. This is important since many people do this—your own story shows it. So really digging in to why students don't want to read, what they fear, why they rather do all the work to scam it (which is more work than reading) than actually read. Next, I would attend to what in the book worked for you. I feel like you read a book about a movie you loved and that's why you liked that book, but I don't know why you'd like another book that you didn't know the movie for. But you are claiming here that you did. So developing how that is true, perhaps with examples. Will strengthen the piece. Finally, you want to think about how that conundrum of the paper informs your final ideas about teaching. You can't just assign books that have movies, right? I feel like the last paragraph feels detached from the rest of the piece. I don't know why creative pieces would be better. I don't know how you'll get students to love reading by not reading Shakespeare. But, as I said, if you manage the first part of the revision, the second will become easier.